

# New York Law School Law Review

VOLUME 55 • 2010/11



---

The editors of the *New York Law School Law Review* do not consider unsolicited manuscripts.

---

The *New York Law School Law Review* (ISSN 0145-448XX) is published four times a year, and printed and distributed by Joe Christensen, Inc., 1540 Adams Street, Lincoln, Nebraska 68521. Annual subscription price: fifty dollars. Single issues: fifteen dollars. Annual foreign subscriptions: sixty dollars, by surface mail. Address all business communications to the Publication Manager. If a subscriber wishes to discontinue receipt of the *Law Review* at the expiration of his or her subscription, notice to that effect should be sent to the Publication Manager. Otherwise, continuation of the subscription is assumed. For all back issues not from the current volume, contact William S. Hein & Co., 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, New York 14209.

---

Copyright 2010/11 by *New York Law School Law Review*. Subject to the *New York Law School Law Review's* exclusive right to publish the works herein, the individual authors retain the copyright in their work.

---

Editorial and general offices: 185 West Broadway, New York, NY 10013

Telephone: (212) 431-2109

(212) 431-2118

FAX: (212) 431-8193



# New York Law School Law Review

VOLUME 55 • 2010/11

## EDITOR IN CHIEF

Luna Droubi

## MANAGING EDITOR

Justin Ashenfelter

## EXECUTIVE EDITORS

Stephanie Ackerman  
Eirik Cheverud

Jarrold Perry  
Victoria Rosner

## ARTICLES EDITORS

Bret Cahn  
Amanda Carroll  
Danielle Cohen  
Ali Ezzeddine  
Meghan Fay  
Raymond Girnys  
Thomas Lemmo  
Rebecca Quinn  
Courtney Robbins  
Jack Tebele

## ASSOCIATE MANAGING EDITORS

Marisa Chernoff  
Melissa Ferraro  
Zalika Pierre

## WEB EDITORS

Andrew Danza  
Julie Murray  
Ravin Patel  
Ian Turetsky

## NOTES & COMMENTS EDITORS

Sarin Chee  
Michael Cirigilano  
Mireille Dee  
Mariko Gaines  
Christine Garg\*  
Adam Gordon  
Justin Lerner  
Deva Roberts  
Justin Sherman  
Alexander Spillberg  
Nicholas Spindler  
Allison Stultz  
Trevor Timm  
Brittany Weiner  
Jonathan Weinstein

*\*Executive Notes & Comments Editor*

## STAFF EDITORS

Sarah Berent  
Hanna Bondarik Mosolygo  
Jared Bretas  
Giralamo Brunetto  
Angel Dieguez  
Eugene Gibalero

Natalia Gouz  
Dusan Lakic  
James Major  
Adelya Mamedova  
John Marchione  
Vladimir Mironenko

Nicole Negrin  
Alan Nikolaisen  
Kristin Olsen  
Kaydi Osowski  
Emily Pierce  
Caitlin Prior

Natalie Shtifter  
Mara Slakas  
Barry Sobel  
Frank St. Jacques  
Julie Stein  
Izabella Wozniak

## ONLINE STAFF EDITORS

Drew Blumenfeld  
Conor Drury  
Oscar Hagstrom  
Jennifer Harris  
Christopher Harrison

Kate Howard  
Benjamin Hutten  
Henry Hutten  
Aaron Iny  
Jordan Mazur

Suk-Yin Pasquet  
Benjamin Pendroff  
David Pepper  
Stevi Raab  
Kate Salottolo

Thomas Teplitsky  
Bryce Therrien  
Matthew Toporowski  
Brent Vegliacich  
Joshua Zarabi

## MEMBERS

Meredith Abrams  
Danielle Barbuto  
Matthew Beatus  
Dana E. Brodsky  
David M. Brown  
Angelica Campanaro  
Evan Cappelli  
Maria Cheung  
Cynthia Claytor  
John P. Collins  
Elias Demopoulos  
Artem Djukic  
Elliot Dolby-Shields  
Brenna C. Drury  
Timothy Evans  
Natasha Ewart  
Perry Fallick  
Farmun Farahmand  
Mark Ferguson  
Sarah Ferguson  
Andrew Finan  
Molly Fitzpatrick  
Kelly Garner

Sarah Garrod  
Amber Gonzalez  
Jill Gottfred  
Joseph Gregory  
Jamie M. Grosz  
Soon Han  
Daniel Hanan  
Yan Hankin  
Shannon Henderson  
David T. Henek  
Alexander Hill  
Dorian Iafeliece  
John Imhoff  
Julie Jakubik  
Lauren Judy  
Ra'Shaun Kelley  
Nicole Kipnis  
Tara Krieger  
Sarah Kurtz  
Jessica Laumanns  
Jeffrey Lawhorn  
Katherine Lazarow  
Misa H. Le

Daniel Luisi  
Eric Marshall  
Michelle Minarcik  
Nicole Nash  
Renee L. Neier  
Dana F. Nelson  
Kendra Okposo  
Nathan A. Olson  
Anna Ostrom  
Joanna C. Peck  
Michelle Podolsky  
Marie Louise Priolo  
Hilary Pugmire  
Jillian Raines  
Adam Rich  
Amelia Russell  
Gregory Salton  
Shawn Sandler  
Jonathan M. Sharret  
Emi Shinozaki  
Colette Siesholtz  
Elizabeth Silva  
Alex Silverman

Chelsea Silverstein  
Jamie Sinclair  
Alexander Sokoloff  
Matthew F. Spano  
James Marshall Spector  
Bradford Sussman  
Nicholas R. Tambone  
Georgina Tsakrios  
Nicholas Turner  
Steven Ward  
Amanda Waye  
Jesse C. Weber  
Geoffrey Weg  
Charles J. Weinstein  
Lauren H. Whiting  
Stephanie L. Wiegand  
Molly Wilk  
Katherine Wood  
Antoinette Worrell  
Kristina Wright  
George Zalepa  
Susan Zhu

## PUBLISHER

Marcey Grigsby

## PUBLICATION MANAGER

Usheevii King



# New York Law School Law Review

© Copyright 2010/11 *New York Law School Law Review*

VOLUME 55 • 2010/11

## CONTENTS

### I. D Is for Digitize Symposium

D Is for Digitize: An Introduction . . . . .	<i>James Grimmelman</i>	11
The Google Book Settlement and the Fair Use Counterfactual . . . . .	<i>Matthew Sag</i>	19
Fulfilling the Copyright Social Justice Promise: Digitizing Textual Information . . . . .	<i>Lateef Mtima and Steven D. Jamar</i>	77
Orphan Works and the Google Book Search Settlement: An International Perspective. . . . .	<i>Bernard Lang</i>	111
H Is for Harmonization: The Google Book Search Settlement and Orphan Works Legislation in the European Union . . . . .	<i>Katharina de la Durantaye</i>	157
Continued DOJ Oversight of the Google Book Search Settlement: Defending Our Public Values and Protecting Competition . . . . .	<i>Christopher A. Suarez</i>	175
Digital + Library: Mass Book Digitization as Collective Inquiry. . . . .	<i>Mary Murrell</i>	221
The Why in DIY Book Scanning . . . . .	<i>Daniel Reetz</i>	251

## II. Notes

Bricks, Mortar, and Google: Defining the Relevant Antitrust Market for Internet-Based Companies. . . . .	<i>Jared Kagan</i>	271
Software Wars: The Patent Menace . . . . .	<i>Andrew Nieb</i>	295

## III. Comments

Cohen v. Google, Inc. . . . .	<i>Eirik Cheverud</i>	333
United States v. Memorial Sloan-Kettering Cancer Center . . . . .	<i>Justin Lerner</i>	359
Sifre v. Sifre . . . . .	<i>Victoria Rosner</i>	371
In re Miguel M. . . . .	<i>Jonathan Weinstein</i>	385
Bayer Schering Pharma AG v. Barr Laboratories, Inc. . . . .	<i>Joshua Zarabi</i>	399